

1 LATHAM & WATKINS LLP
2 Elizabeth L. Deeley (CA Bar No. 230798)
elizabeth.deeley@lw.com
3 Melanie M. Blunschi (CA Bar No. 234264)
melanie.blunschi@lw.com
4 505 Montgomery Street, Suite 2000
San Francisco, CA 94111-6538
5 Telephone: +1.415.391.0600
Facsimile: +1.415.395.8095
6

7 *Attorneys for Defendant Facebook, Inc.*

8 *[Additional counsel listed on signature page]*

9
10 **UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**
11 **NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**
12 **SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION**

13
14 LUIS LICEA., individually, and
on behalf of a class of similarly situated
individuals,
15 Plaintiff,

16 v.

17 FACEBOOK, INC.,

18 Defendant.

19
20 CARLA ECHAVARRIA, an individual and
California Resident and DERRICK
WALKER, an individual and Virginia
Resident,
21

22 Plaintiffs,

23 v.

24 FACEBOOK, INC.,

25 Defendant.

26 Case No. 19-CV-00117-WHA

Related to:
No. C 18-05982-WHA

27 **STIPULATION AND [PROPOSED]
ORDER TO CONSOLIDATE RELATED
CASES**

28 Case No. C 18-05982 WHA

Related to:
No. C 18-06022 WHA
No. C 18-06172 WHA
No. C 18-06246 WHA
No. C 18-06263 WHA
No. C 18-06511 WHA
No. C 18-06583 WHA
No. C 18-06657 WHA
No. C 18-06887 WHA
No. C 18-06953 WHA

1 WHEREAS, on September 28, 2018, *Echavarria v. Facebook, Inc.*, Case No. 18-cv-05982-WHA (“*Echavarria*”) was filed in the United States District Court for the Northern District of California and assigned to the Honorable William Alsup;

4 WHEREAS, in subsequent weeks, nine other putative class actions arising out of the same facts and circumstances as the *Echavarria* case (together, the “Related Cases”) were filed in or removed to this Court, and each was deemed related to *Echavarria*;

7 WHEREAS, on October 18, 2018, *Luis Licea v. Facebook, Inc.*, Case No. 18STCV01331 (“*Licea*”) was filed in Los Angeles Superior Court;

9 WHEREAS, on December 13, 2018, Facebook, Inc. (“Facebook”) removed *Licea* to the 10 United States District Court for the Central District of California (*see Licea*, Dkt. 1);

11 WHEREAS, on January 2, 2019, counsel for Facebook and counsel for Luis Licea 12 stipulated to transfer *Licea* to the United States District Court for the Northern District of 13 California pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1404(a), on the grounds that *Echavarria* and the Related Cases 14 are pending in this Court (*see Licea*, Dkt. 11);

15 WHEREAS, on January 8, 2019, the Honorable R. Gary Klausner ordered *Licea* 16 transferred to the United States District Court for the Northern District of California (*see Licea*, 17 Dkt. 12);

18 WHEREAS, on January 10, 2019, *Licea* was assigned to the Honorable Magistrate Judge 19 Laurel Beeler (*see Licea*, Dkt. 14);

20 WHEREAS, on January 10, 2019, Judge Alsup issued a Case Management Scheduling 21 Order, which consolidated *Echavarria* and the Related Cases (together, the “Consolidated Cases”) 22 under Case No. C 18-05982 WHA and placed those cases on a single schedule for purposes of 23 case management (*see Echavarria*, Dkt. 67);

24 WHEREAS, on January 17, 2019, Magistrate Judge Beeler referred *Licea* to Judge Alsup 25 for consideration of whether *Licea* is related to *Echavarria* (*see Licea*, Dkt. 16; *Echavarria*, Dkt. 26 73);

27

28

1 WHEREAS, on January 17, 2019, Judge Alsup issued a Related Case Order relating *Licea*
2 to *Echavarria* (see *Licea*, Dkt. 17; *Echavarria*, Dkt. 74);

3 WHEREAS, *Licea* was reassigned to Judge Alsup, and the case number was updated to:
4 19-cv-00117-WHA (see *Licea*, Dkt. 17; *Echavarria*, Dkt. 74);

5 WHEREAS Fed. R. Civ. P. 42(a)(2) provides that “[i]f actions before the court involve a
6 common question of law or fact, the court may . . . consolidate the actions”;

7 WHEREAS, *Licea* arises from common questions of law or fact as those alleged in the
8 Consolidated Cases; and

9 WHEREAS, Facebook, Luis Licea, and plaintiffs in the Consolidated Cases wish to
10 consolidate *Licea* with the Consolidated Cases for administrative efficiency and so that *Licea* may
11 proceed on the same schedule identified in the Case Management Scheduling Order.

12 **IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED AND AGREED BY THE PARTIES THAT:**

13 *Licea* (Case No. 19-cv-00117-WHA) shall be consolidated with the Consolidated Cases
14 (Case No. C 18-05982 WHA) for all purposes, including pretrial proceedings, trial, and appeal,
15 pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 42(a)(2). Upon such consolidation, the Case
16 Management Scheduling Order for Case No. C 18-05982 WHA shall apply to *Licea*. (See
17 *Echavarria*, Dkt. 67).

18 DATED: February 11, 2019

LATHAM & WATKINS LLP

19 By: /s/ Melanie M. Blunschi
20 Elizabeth L. Deeley (CA Bar No. 230798)
21 elizabeth.deeley@lw.com
22 Melanie M. Blunschi (CA Bar No. 234264)
23 melanie.blunschi@lw.com
24 505 Montgomery Street, Suite 2000
25 San Francisco, California 94111-6538
26 Telephone: +1.415.391.0600
27 Facsimile: +1.415.395.8095

28 Attorneys for Defendant Facebook, Inc.

26 DATED: February 11, 2019

GIRARDI | KEESE

27 By: /s/ Keith D. Griffin

1 Thomas V. Girardi
2 Keith D. Griffin (CA Bar No. 204388)
3 1126 Wilshire Boulevard
4 Los Angeles, CA 90017
5 Telephone: +1.213.977.0211
6 Facsimile: +1.213.481.1554
7 *kgriffin@girardikeese.com*

8 LIVINGSTON BAKHTIAR
9 Ebby S. Bakhitar
10 3435 Wilshire Boulevard
11 Suite 1669
12 Los Angeles, CA 90017
13 Telephone: +1.213.632.1550
14 Facsimile: +1.213.632-3100
15 *esb@lb-lawyers.com*

16 *Attorneys for Plaintiff Luis Licea*

17 Dated: February 11, 2019

18 **MORGAN & MORGAN**
19 **COMPLEX LITIGATION GROUP**

20 By: /s/ Ryan J. McGee
21 John A. Yanchunis (Pro Hac Vice)
22 *JYanchunis@ForThePeople.com*
23 Ryan J. McGee (Pro Hac Vice)
24 201 N. Franklin Street, 7th Floor
25 Tampa, Florida 33602
26 Telephone: 813-223-5505
27 Facsimile: 813-223-5402

28 *Counsel for Echavarria and the Class*

17 Dated: February 11, 2019

18 **CAPSTONE LAW APC**

19 By: /s/ Ryan J. McGee (as authorized)
20 Tarek Zohdy (CA Bar No. 247775)
21 *Tarek.Zohdy@CapstoneLawyers.com*
22 1875 Century Park East, Suite 1000
23 Los Angeles, California 90067
24 Telephone: 310-556-4811
25 Facsimile: 310-943-0396

26 *Counsel for Bass, Jr. and the Class*

27 Dated: February 11, 2019

28 **STULL, STULL & BRODY**

1 By: /s/ Ryan J. McGee (as authorized)
2

3 Melissa R. Emert (Pro Hac Vice)
4 *MEmert@ssbny.com*
5 6 East 45th St, 4th Floor
6 New York, New York 10017
7 Telephone: 212-687-7230
8 Facsimile: 212-490-2022

9 *Counsel for Bendetowies and the Class*

10 **KOHN, SWIFT & GRAF, P.C.**

11 By: /s/ Ryan J. McGee (as authorized)
12

13 Jonathan Shub (CA Bar No. 237708)
14 *JShub@KohnSwift.com*
15 1600 Market Street, Suite 2500
16 Philadelphia, PA 19103-7225
17 Telephone: 215-238-1700
18 Facsimile: 215-238-1968

19 *Counsel for Elkassem and the Class*

20 **FRANKLIN D. AZAR & ASSOCIATES**

21 By: /s/ Ryan J. McGee (as authorized)
22

23 Ivy Ngo (CA Bar No. 249860)
24 *NgoI@FDAZar.com*
25 14426 East Evans Avenue
26 Aurora, CO 80014
27 Telephone: 303-757-3300
28 Facsimile: 720-213-5131

29 *Counsel for King and the Class*

30 **MILBERG TADLER PHILLIPS
31 GROSSMAN LLP**

32 By: /s/ Ryan J. McGee (as authorized)
33

34 Ariana J. Tadler
35 *ATadler@milberg.com*
36 One Penn Plaza
37 New York, NY 10119
38 Telephone: 212-594-5300
39 Facsimile: 212-868-1229

40 *Counsel for McGuire and the Class*

1
2 Dated: February 11, 2019

ROBINSON CALCAGNIE, INC.

3 By: /s/Ryan J. McGee (as authorized)

4 Daniel S. Robinson

5 *DRobinson@RobinsonFirm.com*

6 19 Corporate Plaza Drive

7 Newport Beach, CA 92660

8 Telephone: 949-720-1288

9 Facsimile: 949-720-1292

10 *Counsel for Joseph Melendez and the Class*

11 Dated: February 11, 2019

COHEN MILSTEIN SELLERS & TOLL PLLC

12 By: /s/ Ryan J. McGee (as authorized)

13 Andrew N. Friedman (Pro Hac Vice)

14 *AFriedman@CohenMilstein.com*

15 1100 New York Avenue NW, Suite 500

16 Washington, DC 20005

17 Telephone: 202-408-4600

18 Facsimile: 202-408-4699

19 *Counsel for Meneses and the Class*

20 Dated: February 11, 2019

**CASEY GERRY SCHENK FRANCAVILLA
BLATT & PENFIELD LLP**

21 By: /s/ Ryan J. McGee (as authorized)

22 Gayle M. Blatt

23 110 Laurel Street

24 San Diego, CA 92101

25 Telephone: 619-238-1811

26 Facsimile: 619-544-9232

27 *Counsel for Joseph Schmidt and the Class*

28 Dated: February 11, 2019

GLANCY PRONGAY & MURRAY LLP

29 By: /s/ Ryan J. McGee (as authorized)

30 Marc L. Godino

31 *MGodino@GlancyLaw.com*

32 1925 Century Park East, Suite 2100

33 Los Angeles, California 90067

34 Telephone: 212-682-5340

35 Facsimile: 212-884-0988

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

Counsel for Wiik and the Class

1 **PURSUANT TO STIPULATION, IT IS SO ORDERED.**
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

DATED: _____

Hon. William Alsup
United States District Court Judge

SIGNATURE ATTESTATION

I am the ECF User whose identification and password are being used to file Stipulation and [Proposed] Order to Consolidate Related Cases regarding signatures. I, Melanie M. Blunschi, attest that concurrence in the filing of this document has been obtained.

DATED: February 11, 2019

/s/ Melanie M. Blunschi

Melanie M. Blunschi (CA Bar No. 234264)